

The regular meeting of the **Historic District Commission** was held on Tuesday November 15, 2016, at 5:00 p.m. in the Development Conference Room of Town Hall, 500 Poplar View Parkway.

The following Staff members were present: Development Director, Mr. Jay Cravens; Town Planner, Mr. Jaime Groce; Assistant Town Planner, Mrs. Nancy Boatwright; Mr. Matthew Wilkinson, Planner; and Administrative Specialist, Mrs. Sandi Robbins.

Roll Call:

Chairman Lee asked Mrs. Robbins to call the roll to see if there was a quorum.

Kelsey – absent, **Rozanski** – present, **Cox** – present, **Todd** – present, **Lee** – present, **Brooks** – absent, **Walker** – absent.

Quorum present.

Approval of Minutes

Chairman Lee asked if there were any corrections to the minutes from the October 27, 2016 meeting.

Hearing none, Chairman Lee called for a motion to approve the minutes as presented.

Motion by Commissioner Cox, and seconded, to accept the minutes from the October 27, 2016 meeting.

Roll Call:

Rozanski – yes, Todd-abstain, Cox-abstain, Lee – yes.

Motion approved.

Approval of the Agenda

Chairman Lee asked if there were any changes to the agenda.

Mr. Jaime Groce stated no it is exactly as advertised in the newspaper.

Motion by Commissioner Rozanski, and seconded, to approve the agenda as presented.

Roll Call:

Rozanski – yes, Todd - yes, Cox - yes, Lee – yes.

Motion Approved.

Formal Agenda:

HDC16-44 – 186 E. Poplar – Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of an accessory structure, exterior alterations to the principle structure including an addition, construction of a new accessory structure, and new front yard fencing.

Mr. Matthew Wilkinson gave the staff presentation as outlined in the staff report. He stated the house is listed on the National Register Nominating Form and described as a stuccoed-frame bungalow with

Craftsman influence. The house and garage are contributing structures in the Historic District. He stated the HDC has seen this house before in 2014 including a request to include new fencing, new metal garage door and lighting, removal of the drive from where a lean-to was located, removal of a window from the south elevation of the bedroom wing of the home, replacing the deteriorating wood siding with Hardi Board, and painting the stucco. The replacing of the siding with Hardi Board was never acted upon and is being requested with this application. The second request was for a new front porch cover which is new on the house. He explained what the fencing will look like and what materials will be used. He stated that in 2016 the fencing ordinance was updated and included a maximum opacity, but masonry wall are exempt from this requirement, but are required to go before the HDC. He explained how the wall and terrace will look. He stated the existing garage was built with the house and is described by the National Register Form as having a gable roof, asbestos siding, and a dirt and gravel floor. These features could limit its functionality as a modern garage. He explained what the new garage will look like along with the materials that are being proposed. The original house is a one-story bungalow style house, in which its defining characteristics are its stucco exterior, and a Dutch-hipped front gabled roof, described by the National Register Nomination Form as a jerkinhead gable end.

EXHIBITS

1. Applicant's Cover Letter (10/25/16)
2. Existing Conditions (10/25/16)
3. Plot Plan (10/25/16)
4. Demolition Plan (10/25/16)
5. Proposed Floor Plan (10/25/16)
6. Black & White Elevations & Fence Plan (10/25/16)
7. Color Elevation (11/8/16)
8. Material Example Photos (11/8/16)
9. 2004 Historic Survey Printout
10. 1989 Collierville Historic District Nomination Form Excerpt
11. Existing Conditions Images (10/25/16)
12. Map of Collierville Historic District
13. 2/20/14 HDC Meeting Minutes
14. 10/16/14 HDC Meeting Minutes
15. HABS Short Format for Documenting a Historic Resource

Mr. Wilkinson explained the proposed addition. He stated the addition is smaller than the original structure and adds additional materials but will widen the house along the Poplar frontage and could over power the original structure. The Historic District Guidelines state "new parking should be located to the sides and rear of existing buildings and should be screened with landscaping if the area is prominently visible from a public right-of-way." The proposed parking pad is in a required front yard, as the lot is a corner lot. He stated there are other front parking areas located on Main Street. He explained the material and details of the siding and roofing for the new addition. He explained the kind of windows that are being proposed. The applicant will be adding two (2) new windows to the original portion of the house in addition to the new windows for the addition.

Mr. Jaime Groce explained what the Design Guidelines stated about windows used in the Historic District.

Mr. Wilkinson explained the next steps for the applicant if the HDC were to approve their request.

When Mr. Wilkinson was reviewing the example motion and conditions there was a discussion about requiring the true divided lights to be wood.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any questions of staff.

Hearing no further questions, Chairman Lee asked the applicant if he would like to make a statement.

Mr. Christopher Speltz, Renaissance Group, 9700 Village Circle, #100, Lakeland, TN 38002, did not wish to make a statement but could answer any questions.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any questions of applicant.

Chairman Lee asked if the yard has a slope down to the corner.

Mr. Speltz confirmed that it does slope. He believed there was a computer drawing that shows the slope of the lot.

There was a discussion over the best way to maintain the wall 38” to 42” above ground level based on the topography of the property.

Chairman Lee asked what his plan was for the two new windows on the existing house.

Mr. Speltz stated they believe they will use the wood because they want it to remain true to the original features.

Chairman Lee would be in favor adding wood windows.

There was a discussion over how the applicant was going to get the existing windows to match the new ones.

Hearing no further comments, Chairman Lee called for a motion.

Motion by Commissioner Cox, and seconded, to approve the applicant’s request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing accessory structure located at 186 E. Poplar Ave., subject to the following conditions:

1. A demolition permit shall be obtained prior to any demolition.
2. If a building permit is not issued for the property within 90 days of the date of the approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness, the portion of the property where the garage was located shall be seeded or sodded, as appropriate, to create a lawn area similar to other properties in the community.
3. Any changes/deviations from this request will require staff and/or HDC approval prior to the work commencing.

It was discussed if the applicant does not pull a building permit for the new garage within 12 months of demolition then they are no longer allowed to use the nonconforming setbacks per what is written in the Ordinance. In this discussion the applicant acknowledged they understood this requirement.

Chairman Lee stated if there is no other discussion then he will call for a vote.

Roll Call:

Rozanski – yes, Todd - yes, Cox - yes, Lee – yes.

Motion Approved.

Commissioner Rozanski stated he liked the addition and doesn’t see it overpowering the main house. He only has an issue with the parking going in front of the house. He asked if it could fit in on the other side.

Mr. Speltz stated there is a big tree on the other side.

There was a discussion over all the landscaping and how that will help hide the view of the front yard parking.

Chairman Lee stated he normally would try and avoid a parking pad. Where the house is located there is no parking on Poplar and not much parking on Main Street. Due to the restricted parking around the house it would be okay to approve the parking pad for this situation.

There was discussion over the parking pad that use to exist on the property.

Commissioner Cox stated this house was in his family. He always thought it was a tacky house and thinks with the changes they are making really improves it for the better.

Chairman Lee stated he thinks the additions they did two years ago were an improvement. He believes these new improvements will also make the house look very nice. He is a little concerned that the front terrace and wall will dramatically change the character of the house.

Motion by Commissioner Rozanski, and seconded, to approve the applicant's request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations and fencing at 186 East Poplar Avenue (per Exhibits 4, 5, 6, 7, and 8), subject to the following conditions:

1. A completed Fence Permit application is required to be submitted to the Codes Division prior to the issuance of a Fence Permit and a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. A sample of the proposed Hardi Board shiplap siding shall be provided for approval by staff or the HDC prior to the issuance of a building permit.
3. A color sample and color number will be required for the garage doors prior to the issuance of a building permit.
4. The new lights shall not be over 60 watts to meet the Light Ordinance requirements.
5. Additional information about the texture, color, and finish of the concrete driveway and walkways shall be provided on Exhibit 5 for review by Staff. The finish shall be compatible with the existing driveway and other driveways and sidewalks in the area. Bright white concrete shall be avoided, as it is not appropriate for the area.
6. Exhibit 6 shall be revised to denote that the simulated divided light windows on the addition shall have exterior grids with either paintable cellular PVC material or a wood product for windows visible from public streets, with the finish, sash, depth of reveal and muntin (grid) configuration to closely resemble the existing windows on the house.
7. New windows to be installed on the existing historic portion of the home shall have true divided lights, be made of wood, and be of the same dimensions and shape of the existing windows on the home.
8. Evergreen landscaping shall be installed along the western and southern edges of the proposed parking pad to screen it from N. Main Street and Poplar Avenue.
9. The detached garage shall be documented thoroughly through photographs and measured drawings according to Historic American Building Survey Standards using the short format. The resulting information shall be retained by the offices of the Collierville Planning Department and with the Tennessee Historical Commission.
10. Any changes or deviations from the approved plans will require staff and/or HDC approval prior to construction.

Chairman Lee stated if there is no other discussion then he will call for a vote.

Roll Call:

Rozanski – yes, Todd - yes, Cox - yes, Lee – yes.

Motion Approved.

HDC16-43– 216 Natchez Street – Request a Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Alterations

Mr. Jaime Groce gave the staff presentation as outlined in the staff report. He stated this is Lot 6 in Stratton Heights Subdivision. This is a historic structure, and is known as the Humphrey’s House built circa 1890. It is listed on the National Register Form as a contributing structure, one-story, wood siding, Y-plan house. It is highlighted in the nomination form as “a particularly notable example of a rare vernacular form because of its Y-shaped plan.” There is nothing else like this in our Historic District and he has heard architects say they have never seen anything like it. He stated the windows could be original to the house, but even if they aren’t they are very old. He described the features of this house and explained the alterations the applicant would like to make to the house.

EXHIBITS

1. Applicant’s cover letter (10/25/16)
2. Window Details (received 10/25/16)
3. Exterior Elevations with Interior Floor Plan (received 10/25/16)
4. Excerpt from Stratton Heights Final Plat (received 10/25/16)
5. HDC Guidelines for Windows (2002, as amended)
6. Excerpt from National Register Nomination Form for 216 Natchez Street (1989)
7. Excerpt from National Register Nomination Form (1989)
8. Excerpt from 2004 Historic Resource Survey
9. Contractor Letter (11/15/16)

Mr. Groce stated the applicant has found a high quality and functional replacement window that emulates the design and texture of the existing windows. He explained the details of the window they would like to use. He stated the guidelines state if you have wood siding then it must be replaced with wood siding. He introduced a new exhibit #9, a letter from the contractor explaining the reasons why the applicant would like to replace the windows. Mr. Groce stated the windows can be repaired. The guidelines do say if a window is not salvageable then it could be replaced.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any questions of staff.

There was a discussion over if the applicant should replace the windows or have them repaired.

Hearing no further questions, Chairman Lee asked the applicant if he would like to make a statement.

Mr. Glen Watkins, Glen Watkins Construction, 93 Hillwood Lane Collierville, TN 38017, stated when people buy houses they have expectations of being able to do things to their house. The owner is really adamant about putting in new windows because he would like working windows and to get rid of the storm windows. Mr. Watkins stated it is possible the windows could be dismantled and repaired to make them work.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any other questions of applicant.

Commissioner Ronzanski stated but there is no way you could do that and they would be thermally efficient. They will still be single pane glass therefore still requiring storm windows.

There was a discussion over issues with storm windows.

A discussion ensued about the existing trims being replaced with the new windows.

Chairman Lee stated he supports removing the door so the kitchen can be more functional and replacing it with a true divided light wood window and wood siding to replace what will have to be removed. He believes that will be consistent with the guidelines. He understands the desire to replace the windows but his first preference would be to repair the wood and his second would be to replace the existing windows with true divided light wood windows. He believes this house is so unique and a treasure for the Town of

Collierville. He would not feel comfortable replacing these windows with non-true divided light windows of a PVC nature.

Commissioner Cox asked what the cost difference between replacing or repairing these windows?

Mr. Watkins stated he could probably repair the windows cheaper than replacing them. He stated he couldn't really speak to what the owner would prefer to do. He stated the owner loves the house.

Commissioner Cox stated the old windows in his house don't work, but, historically you can tell the difference. He believes old windows are really nice and agrees with repairing the windows instead of replacing them because they are unique. He is fine with removing the door because he doesn't think the door was original to the house.

Mr. Watkins stated their plan is to take the door they are removing and repurpose it to replace a door that doesn't match. He stated the door they are repurposing matches all the other doors in the house.

Hearing no further comments, Chairman Lee called for a motion.

Motion by Commissioner Cox, and seconded, to approve the applicant's request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations (Exhibits 1, 2, and 3), subject to the following conditions:

1. Any changes or deviations from the approved plans will require staff and/or HDC approval prior to the work being undertaken.
2. ~~Replacement windows shall be double hung windows with the same dimensions and shape of the existing windows with true divided lights, not false muntins/grills. The replacement windows shall fill the existing openings exactly without altering the walls. Replacement sashes shall also fit the window opening and replicate the existing sash dimensions.~~ First preference is to repair the existing windows as they are. Any replacement necessitated due to being unrepairable shall be replaced with true divided light wood windows of the same dimension. Refer to Staff decision if any window is unrepairable.
3. Wood siding shall be used to fill in where the existing door will be replaced with a new window. The width and texture of the wood shall be identical to the original size and shape of the wood siding on the house.

Chairman Lee stated if there is no other discussion then he will call for a vote.

Roll Call:

Rozanski – yes, Todd - yes, Cox - yes, Lee – yes.

Motion Approved.

HDC16-45 –244 College Street– Request a Certificate of Appropriateness for Exterior Alterations

Mrs. Nancy Boatwright gave the staff presentation as outlined in the staff report. She stated the dimensions of the lot do not meet the R-1 standards. If the HDC approves the request then the applicant will need to go to the BZA to get a variance to encroach into the rear yard. This property is not within the National Register District, and according to the 2004 survey, it is not eligible for the National Register District. The 2004 survey describes this

EXHIBITS

1. Applicant's Cover Letter (rec'd 10/27/16)
2. Architect's Letter (rec'd 10/27/16)
3. Register of Deeds' Aerial (rec'd 10/27/16)
4. Proposed Site Plan (rec'd 10/27/16)
5. Applicants' Site Photos and Rendering (rec'd 10/27/16)
6. Applicants' Photos of Other Residences in the Historic District (rec'd 10/27/16)
7. Architect's Drawings of Proposed Additions (rec'd 10/27/16)
8. Photo of Proposed Light Fixture
9. 2004 Historic Survey
10. Map of Collierville Historic District

residence as Plain/Traditional. This house was built in 1940, and an addition was made to the rear of the house in 1974. The original portion of the home is covered in Masonite siding, and the rear addition is covered in board and batten siding. The proposed new porch and roof dormer will give the house a more Bungalow style look.

The proposed addition will be 500 square feet and will increase the size of the residence to 2,260 square feet, and will add space on both sides of the residence but will not widen the footprint. The new front porch will extend approximately 7 feet beyond the current façade, which will be closer to the street than the house to the east but farther from the street than the house to the west. The additions to the rear will be visible from College Street. She explained the details of which existing features will stay and what others will be replaced with. Typically with new additions they are supposed to be different, but for this situation, the architect doesn't think another siding type will be appropriate, so the applicant would like to continue to use board and batten.

There was a discussion over the new addition eliminating the old board and batten siding.

Mrs. Boatwright explained the next steps for the applicant if the HDC approves their request.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any questions of staff.

The applicant, Mr. Gregg Brewer, 244 College Street, joined in a discussion over the type of existing windows at the back of the house and the type of windows the applicant was thinking of using for the addition.

Commissioner Rozanski stated the applicant is doing such a nice job updating this house.

Commissioner Cox stated he loves what they are doing to this house.

Hearing no further comments, Chairman Lee called for a motion.

Motion by Commissioner Todd, and seconded, to approve the applicant's request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations at 244 College Street (per Exhibits 1, 2, 4, 5 7 and 8), subject to the following conditions:

1. Additional information about the texture, color, and finish of the possible concrete walkway shall be provided and the finish shall be compatible with other driveways and sidewalks in the area. Washed gravel is a permitted material. Bright white concrete shall be avoided.
2. Provide a sample of the stone veneer prior to the issuance of a building permit. Authentic stone shall be used and shall be a color and type that matches stone used on historic structures in the Historic District.
3. Any changes or deviations from the approved plans will require staff and/or HDC approval prior to construction.
4. Use simulated divided light windows on the additions.

Chairman Lee stated if there is no other discussion then he will call for a vote.

Roll Call:

Rozanski – yes, Todd - yes, Cox - yes, Lee – yes.

Motion Approved.

Other Business

Chairman Lee asked if there was any other business.

Mr. Jaime Groce introduced the new Development Director, Jay Cravens.

Mr. Groce stated at the last HDC meeting a roof top addition was approved for 50 N Main and he showed the HDC elevations of the new changes. There was a discussion over where the dumpsters were going to be placed.

Mr. Groce stated 148 North received a temporary Certificate of Occupancy and had a soft opening this weekend. There was a discussion over the awning metal not being as shiny as it once was because of the muriatic acid.

Mr. Groce explained possible plans for the redevelopment 170 Washington Street.

There was a discussion over consolidating directional signs in the Historic District.

There was a discussion over the concern of cutting down historic trees. It was understood that it needs to happen sometimes in the case of infill but it was suggested that Staff bring more information to the HDC on what would be the next step to place some type of protection for heritage trees in the Historic District.

With no further business, Chairman Lee adjourned the meeting at 6:19 p.m.

Secretary, Laura Todd